Anisotropic Electron Tail Generation during Tearing Mode Magnetic Reconnection


Department of Physics, University of Wisconsin–Madison, Madison, Wisconsin 53706, USA

(Received 19 August 2016; published 14 February 2017)

The first experimental evidence of anisotropic electron energization during magnetic reconnection that favors a direction perpendicular to the guide magnetic field in a toroidal, magnetically confined plasma is reported in this Letter. Magnetic reconnection plays an important role in particle heating, energization, and transport in space and laboratory plasmas. In toroidal devices like the Madison Symmetric Torus, discrete magnetic reconnection events release large amounts of energy from the equilibrium magnetic field. Fast x-ray measurements imply a non-Maxwellian, anisotropic energetic electron tail is formed at the time of reconnection. The tail is well described by a power-law energy dependence. The expected bremsstrahlung from an electron distribution with an anisotropic energetic tail \(v_\perp > v_\parallel\) spatially localized in the core region is consistent with x-ray emission measurements. A turbulent process related to tearing fluctuations is the most likely cause for the energetic electron tail formation.

Magnetic reconnection (MR) is characterized by impulsive, discrete bursts of released magnetic energy \(U_{\text{mag}}\). The release of \(U_{\text{mag}}\) and conversion to kinetic energy, plays an important role in particle transport and energization (heating and acceleration) in space and laboratory plasmas. In particular, electron energization during MR has been observed in the magnetotail [1–3], during magnetospheric substorms [4,5], during solar flares [6,7], and in laboratory experiments [8–15]. However, the mechanisms leading to the onset of MR and the energization of particles are not fully understood.

One of the major outstanding questions for electron acceleration during MR is whether the process is localized inside or outside of the diffusion region. The WIND spacecraft provided the first evidence of electron acceleration localized to the diffusion region, where the power-law spectra were more energetic compared to the outflow region and favors directions parallel or antiparallel to the guide field [3]. The symmetry between the parallel and antiparallel spectra suggests electrons may be energized by a process other than parallel electric fields in the diffusion region. It was later confirmed by CLUSTER that electrons can be accelerated by pitch angle scattering [16]. Relative to space-based observations, where in situ measurements are challenging, laboratory experiments provide a controlled environment to study electron energization during MR. Electron energization is commonly observed during the internal kink mode sawtooth cycle in tokamak plasmas. Parallel and antiparallel anisotropy in x-ray emission from nonthermal electrons, attributed to runaway acceleration driven by the inductive electric field created during the impulsive sawtooth crash, has been measured in the T-10 [10], VTF [8], TCV [9], and PLT [11] tokamaks.

This Letter presents the first experimental evidence for anisotropic electron energization during MR that favors a direction perpendicular to the mean (or guide) magnetic field in a toroidal, magnetically confined plasma. The anisotropy appears as a nonthermal tail in the x-ray energy spectrum during MR events in reversed field pinch (RFP) plasmas. The x-ray tail fits a power law that flattens during MR. Runaway energization is ruled out by measured parallel or antiparallel symmetry in the x-ray flux. This is also the first evidence that electron energization accompanies the better-studied ion energization during MR in RFP plasmas [17,18].

The experiments described below were performed in the MST [19] RFP experiment having a major radius \(R = 1.5\) m and a minor radius \(a = 0.52\) m. MR in RFP plasmas stems from several tearing modes that are destabilized by the parallel current density gradient, and the nonlinear interaction between stable and unstable modes results in a quasiperiodic magnetic relaxation cycle that causes a sudden release of stored \(U_{\text{mag}}\) during the fast (~100 \(\mu s\)) crash phase [20]. This cycle resembles the internal kink mode sawtooth process in tokamak plasmas in some respects, but it is more global in RFP plasmas due to its multimode nature. The overlap of magnetic islands from multiple tearing modes leads to widespread magnetic stochasticity, enhancing particle and energy transport [21–23]. Figure 1 shows two typical magnetic relaxation cycles during a single discharge in MST. Figure 1(a) shows \(U_{\text{mag}}\) during a 10 ms window. The magnetic fluctuation amplitudes for an unstable core-resonant \(m = 1, n = 6\) mode (blue, dashed) and a nonlinearly driven edge-resonant \(m = 0, n = 1\) mode (red, solid) are shown in Fig. 1(b), where \(m\) and \(n\) are the poloidal and toroidal mode numbers. The insets in Fig. 1 show the evolution (relative to MR) of \(U_{\text{mag}}\) (top) and magnetic fluctuation amplitudes (bottom) averaged over 485 MR events. At the MR event, 20–30 kJ of \(U_{\text{mag}}\) is released in 100 \(\mu s\), and both core and edge-resonant mode amplitudes peak.

DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevLett.118.075001
While ions are strongly energized during MR events (bulk heating and energetic ion tail formation) [17,18], the thermal population of electrons is measured by Thomson scattering to cool following MR [23,24]. Magnetic stochasticity is maximum during MR, and high mobility makes electrons susceptible to rapid transport. Hence, possible energization of electrons is anticipated to be transient on a $\sim 10 \mu$s time scale, making high time resolution measurements necessary to reveal electron dynamics. We report energy-resolved bremsstrahlung emission showing an enhancement in the high energy x-ray flux during MR events in MST plasmas. Measurements were taken with a fast x-ray (FXR) diagnostic [25] that consists of a Si avalanche photodiode with optimal energy range of 3–25 keV and a 20 ns Gaussian shaping time.

We first describe x-ray bremsstrahlung emission measured through a 150 $\mu$m thick beryllium (Be) window with a line of sight along a minor radial chord with angular acceptance $\sim 15^\circ$ (Fig. 2, blue), intersecting the magnetic axis (called the radial view hereafter). Data were collected for plasmas with electron density $n_e = 0.8 \times 10^{19}$ m$^{-3}$ and plasma current $I_p = 500$ kA ($B \sim 3$ kG). The electron temperature in the core is $T_e(0) \sim 500$ eV. Figure 3 shows the energy-resolved x-ray flux versus time relative to the MR event ($t = 0$ ms) for an ensemble of 485 MR events like those in Fig. 1, where black represents no measurable flux and red signifies high flux. The x-ray flux for $E > 20$ keV increases around $t = 0$, indicating that energetic electrons are generated during MR. After the MR event, the high energy x-ray flux decays rapidly, implying the energetic electrons are quickly lost, consistent with expectations for stochastic transport.

To quantify the extent of energization, the x-ray distribution is averaged in 20 $\mu$s windows around the MR event between 5 and 25 keV. Figure 4 shows x-ray spectra for 0.5 ms before (black), during (red), and 0.5 ms after (blue) MR. The error bars in Fig. 4 (and Fig. 6 below) are calculated from the uncertainty in the number of x-ray counts, $\sqrt{n}$ (standard deviation for Poisson distributions). To model the flux ($\Gamma$) as a function of energy, each spectrum is fit with a power law, \( \Gamma(E) \propto E^{-\gamma} \), where $\gamma$ is the tail spectral index. The smaller the $\gamma$, the greater the number of energetic x-rays are generated and the flatter the tail becomes. The error in $\gamma$ (hereafter) is estimated from the variance-covariance matrix of the least squares power-law fit for each spectrum. For the spectra in Fig. 4, $\gamma$ in the
Before the MR event, the \( \gamma \) loss in high energy x-ray flux. Fokker-Planck solver \([27]\) to model a stationary test power-law energy distribution localized in electron distribution with a mock runaway tail having a \( \ln(\text{nee}) \) decreases when the \( U_{\text{mag}} \) begins decreasing \( (t \sim -70 \text{ ms}) \). In as little as \( 60 \mu\text{s} \), \( \gamma \) reaches a minimum before there is a loss in high energy x-ray flux. In principle, runaway acceleration of electrons due to the inductive electric field parallel to \( \mathbf{B} \) could produce an energetic x-ray tail in MST plasmas. Experiments in the PLT tokamak studying the angular distribution of bremsstrahlung emitted from runaway electrons showed that x-ray emission peaks in the direction in which electrons travel, leading to a measured toroidal anisotropy in the x-ray velocity distribution \([11]\). Modeling of the bremsstrahlung angular distribution shows this anisotropy occurs for electron energies as low as \( 10^7 \text{ eV} \) \([26]\). If the observed electron energization in MST plasmas is associated with runaway acceleration, the x-ray emission should peak in the direction of the parallel electric field, leading to an anisotropic bremsstrahlung angular distribution. To simulate the expected x-ray flux for electron runaway, we use the \textit{CQL3D} code (a relativistic collisional quasilinear 3D Fokker-Planck solver \([27]\)) to model a stationary test electron distribution with a mock runaway tail having a power-law energy distribution localized in \( v_\parallel \) with density \( \sim 1\% \) of a background thermal (500 eV) Maxwellian distribution \([\text{Fig. 5(a)}]\). The mock tail has a Gaussian radial profile centered on the magnetic axis with a 9 cm radial extent. The code includes a calculation of x-ray bremsstrahlung along prescribed pencil-like lines of sight through the toroidal plasma volume, like that shown in \textit{Fig. 2}. \textit{Fig. 5(b)} shows the modeled x-ray spectra for toroidal lines of sight on the midplane tangential to the magnetic axis that view on-coming (parallel, black) and receding (antiparallel, red) tail electrons. A radial (blue) line of sight through the magnetic axis is also shown. The x-ray flux in the toroidal views favors the parallel direction, as expected \([11]\). To look for asymmetry in the x-ray flux in MST plasmas, the FXR detector was moved to a toroidal view port with a 150 \( \mu\text{m} \) thick Be window and an acceptance angle of \( \sim 5^\circ \) \((\text{Fig. 2, black})\) located just below midplane and centered on the magnetic axis. Experiments were performed with \( E_0 \) in the normal (parallel) and reversed (antiparallel) directions to assess asymmetry in the x-ray flux and underlying electron distribution function (EDF). \textit{Fig. 6} shows the x-ray spectra for a 20 \( \mu\text{s} \) window during MR for views in the parallel (black), antiparallel (red), and radial (blue) directions. The x-ray spectra measured in the toroidal views show tail formation, but they are parallel-antiparallel symmetric within measurement uncertainty, with \( \gamma_\parallel = 3.92 \pm 0.12 \) and \( \gamma_{\text{anti-\parallel}} = 3.73 \pm 0.14 \). Hence, runaway acceleration is not consistent with the measured x-ray tail created by MR. Note that the toroidal views are not strictly parallel to \( \mathbf{B} \) along the line of sight, but \( \parallel \) is used for simplicity. For these plasmas, runaway generation is not expected to be strong since the net emf acting on electrons is below the critical (Dreicer \([28]\)) field, \( E_D = n_e e^3 \ln(\Lambda/4\pi e_0^2 m_e V_{\text{nee}}^2) \). The net large-scale (magnetic

**FIG. 4.** X-ray spectra measured in the radial view for 20 \( \mu\text{s} \) windows 0.5 ms before (black), during (red) and 0.5 ms after (blue) MR. Each spectrum is fit with a power law (solid lines), from which \( \gamma \) is calculated. The inset shows \( \gamma \) as a function of time relative to MR.

**FIG. 5.** (a) EDF used in \textit{CQL3D} to model parallel anisotropy for a power-law tail distribution in \( v_\parallel \). (b) Modeled bremsstrahlung x-ray emission for toroidal parallel (black), toroidal antiparallel (red), and radial (blue) pencil-like lines of sight. (c) EDF used in \textit{CQL3D} to model perpendicular anisotropy for a power-law tail distribution localized in \( v_\perp \). (d) Modeled bremsstrahlung x-ray emission for the same lines of sight as in (b). For both cases, the tail is Gaussian and \( v_\parallel \) and \( v_\perp \) are normalized to \( v_{\text{norm}} = 1.9 \times 10^8 \text{ m/s} \). The modeled emission is normalized for volume of viewing cones through the plasma core.
To assess anisotropy favoring the perpendicular direction while maintaining toroidal symmetry, we model a stationary test EDF with an energetic tail having a power-law energy distribution localized in $v_{\perp}$, again with a density of 1% the background 500 eV Maxwellian distribution [Fig. 5(c)]. The Maxwellian EDF fills the whole plasma volume, but the radial profile of the tail is Gaussian, centered on the magnetic axis with a 9 cm radial extent. Figure 5(d) shows the predicted x-ray spectra for pencil-like lines of sight in the parallel (black), antiparallel (red), and radial (blue) views. The predicted spectra in the toroidal views are symmetric, and for $E > 10$ keV, the flux is larger in the radial view. Thus, an electron tail distribution with strong perpendicular anisotropy is consistent with measurements of bremsstrahlung emission during MR in MST plasmas. Broadening the radial extent of the core-localized tail in the test EDF causes the predicted x-ray flux in toroidal views to eventually become larger than in the radial view, while narrowing the radial extent increases the x-ray flux in the radial view further. This implies that the fast electrons in MST plasmas must be radially localized to ~9 cm of the magnetic axis. This might result in part from weaker stochastic transport in that region, e.g., the residual magnetic island structure associated with the innermost-resonant tearing mode might preserve the integrity of magnetic surfaces near the magnetic axis.

The electron tail correlates with the released $U_{\text{mag}}$ during MR events. The stored $U_{\text{mag}}$ within the plasma volume scales as $U_{\text{mag}} \sim I_p^2$, and the size of the MR event tends to be larger with lower $n_e$. X-ray measurements were obtained for a variety of plasmas with $I_p = 300–500$ kA and $n_e = 0.4–1.5 \times 10^{19}$ m$^{-3}$. The $U_{\text{mag}}$ released during MR, $\Delta U_{\text{mag}}$, is easily determined using reconstructions of the magnetic equilibrium [29]. During MR, $\Delta \gamma_{\perp}$ increases from $\Delta \gamma_{\perp} = 1.94$ for $\Delta U_{\text{mag}} \sim 15$ kJ to $\Delta \gamma_{\perp} = 2.73$ for $\Delta U_{\text{mag}} \sim 55$ kJ. The strength of ion energization exhibits a similar trend with $\Delta U_{\text{mag}}$. The operation with $q(a) = 0$ mutes $\Delta U_{\text{mag}}$ and electron (and ion) energization, since resonant $m = 0$ modes that strongly couple to $m = 1$ modes are removed from the plasma.

In summary, high-time-resolution measurements of x-ray energy spectra provide the first evidence of the formation of an anisotropic energetic electron tail in a toroidal plasma during MR that is not attributable to runaway acceleration. The bremsstrahlung photon energies extend to 20–30 keV during tearing-driven MR in MST plasmas. The energetic tail is characterized by a power law with a spectral index, $\gamma_{\perp}$, which decreases from 4.15 to 2.15 during MR and rapidly increases following the event, consistent with stochastic transport expectations. The measured x-ray tail spectra are large in a radial view and parallel-antiparallel symmetric in toroidal views, which rules out runaway acceleration as the responsible mechanism. An anisotropic EDF with a population of fast ions produces x-ray spectra that exceed the predictions for a Maxwellian EDF and suggest anisotropic energization of the electron tail, consistent with high-time-resolution measurements of x-ray flux and perpendicular anisotropy.

### Figure 6

**X-ray spectra measured for parallel (black), antiparallel (red) and radial (blue) views during a 20 µs window during MR.** The inset shows the evolution of $\gamma$ for the parallel (black) and radial (blue) views.

$\gamma_{\perp}$ is shown in the inset of Fig. 6. To quantify tail generation, $\Delta \gamma = \gamma_{\perp} - \gamma_{\text{d}}$ is calculated before and during MR, with larger $\Delta \gamma$ indicating a larger tail. The $\gamma_{\perp}$ in the radial view ($\Delta \gamma_{\perp} = 2.17 \pm 0.02$) is almost twice as large as in the toroidal view ($\Delta \gamma_{\parallel} = 1.21 \pm 0.02$). Also, note that the tail generation occurs in a narrower time window for toroidal views than for the radial view, indicated by the width of $\gamma$ around 0 ms. The full width half maximum of $\gamma_{\perp}$ is 65.9 ± 3.3 µs compared to 39.1 ± 1.6 µs for $\gamma_{\parallel}$. Also, the decrease in $\gamma_{\parallel}$ is delayed relative to $\gamma_{\perp}$, and $\gamma_{\parallel}$ relaxes faster than $\gamma_{\perp}$ following MR, suggesting an energization process that favors the perpendicular direction, with pitch angle scattering into the parallel direction, followed by relatively rapid parallel transport. Previous ion energization measurements in MST also show anisotropy favoring a perpendicular heating mechanism [18]. The strong correlation with tearing dynamics suggests a turbulent mechanism is similarly active for electron tail energization, although the precise mechanism could be different for electrons and ions.
electronics localized in $v_\perp$ and spatially limited to the core region is consistent with the measured x-ray energy spectra. The dynamics of the x-ray tail correlate with the dynamics of tearing modes and the magnitude of $U_{\text{mag}}$ released by MR, implying a turbulent process is the most likely cause for the anisotropic energetic electron tail formation. These results provide laboratory plasma evidence for electron energization due to a process other than parallel electric fields during MR, similar to WIND spacecraft observations. Perpendicular energization is also observed for ions in MST, which suggests similar mechanisms may operate simultaneously on electrons and ions. These results also provide new opportunity to better understand the conversion of $U_{\text{mag}}$ and particle dynamics, to improve theories that accurately describe MR and particle energization, and to strengthen the connections between MR processes observed in space and laboratory experiments.

The authors thank the UW-Madison MST group for the many valuable discussions. This material is based upon work supported by the U.S. Department of Energy Office of Science, Office of Fusion Energy Sciences program under Award No. DE-FC02-05ER54814 and the National Science Foundation under Grant No. PHY08-21899. MST data shown in this Letter can be obtained in Ref. [31].

*Corresponding author.
amiuibois25@gmail.com